Hannah Bradt

ISM 3A

Mr. Speice

October 26, 2016

<div align="center">Research Assessment 6</div>

Work Cited:

Brown, Brene. "Teachers, Shame, and Worthiness: A Lesson Learned - Brené Brown." *Brene*

     Brown. N.p., 30 Sept. 2013. Web. 26 Oct. 2016.

Minnici, Angela, and David Osher. "Beyond Shame and Blame in the Classroom." *InformED*

     Blog. American Institutes for Research, 16 Feb. 2016. Web. 27 Oct. 2016.

"Teacher Praise: An Efficient Tool to Motivate Students." *Response to Intervention*. Intervention

     Central, n.d. Web. 27 Oct. 2016

Because I have decided to base my overall studies in the Independent Study and Mentorship program on the ways in which shame and guilt, with the incorporation of praise, function in and benefit a classroom setting, I chose to base my sixth research assessment on these ideas. Previously, I had a small amount of experience and knowledge in this field, as I have personally felt a sense shame caused by a teacher, and had the opportunity to be a part of a one day workshop focusing partially on shame and the impact that it can have on an individual. With the three articles that I found while researching for this research assessment, however, I was able to drastically increase the knowledge that I already had.

Overall, the first two articles expanded my knowledge based on shame itself, and the function that it has in a classroom setting. The first article included information from Brene Brown, a scholar, author, and public speaker, whose studies and ideas I chose to base my research on. When I found this article, I was very excited, as the quote that I chose to incorporate into my ISM experience was delivered by Ms. Brown. The article was based on a personal experience from Brene Brown, in which a video of a speech that she gave based on the use of shame by teachers in classroom setting was posted, and began to receive very negative feedback. Because of this, she felt the need to draft an article explaining the video, and to provide information based on experience and research as to the ways in which shame in the classroom has a negative impact on students, highlighting the ways in which this can be monitored. With this information, I had the opportunity to learn that, while it is not realistic to have a completely shame free environment due to human nature, it is completely possible to monitor the use of shame, whether it is intentional or unintentional. This was helpful to me, as I had not realized that some very small instances and situations could lead to a great feeling of shame in some students. Because of my newfound knowledge, I plan to retain this information for future years, and to filter my own thoughts and actions, as to create a classroom that is as near to a 'shame free' environment as possible.

The second article that I chose to include was also based on shame; however, it included a specific example in a video that was released of a teacher openly shaming a first grade student. The article then observed that most school districts have drastically shifted the intent of learning away from preparing students to move into the real world, and moved more toward focusing only on preparing students to pass a standardized test, in order to create a strong and successful

appearance for a specific district. Many in the Frisco Independent School District feel as though this occurs in our city as well, as school years are spent studying mainly for STAAR tests, which are administered in the spring of each school year. After taking these tests, students are sorted into specific categories, based on their testing scores, which then seem to follow them throughout their educational careers, defining each student, rather than allowing students to create their own personal identity with their personalities, achievements, or other, much more reasonable means. Testing scores, either high or low, can be, and often are, used as methods of shame in the life of many. While this seems to be a reality throughout many school districts, it has many negative impacts on students, and should not be the main focus of any school. Rather than focusing only on preparations for standardized testing, curriculum and activities should be changed to focus solely on preparing students to enter into the business and professional world, so that they may be able to hold positions in stable careers, and have the opportunity to live a successful lifestyle. As a future American educator, I plan to create a system in my own classroom in which students will be aided in their preparation to enter the world as upstanding members of a typically harsh society.

Finally, aside from my focus on shame, I also plan to base my studies on incorporating praise in a classroom, and the effects that this will have on students in this environment. In my personal experiences as a student, I have found praise to be very beneficial, and encouraging, as it provides determination and reason to push for success. The third article that I used for this research assessment provided many steps towards utilizing praise in a classroom. While the focus was mainly on the ways in which teachers can use praise, it also implied the ways in which students can benefit from receiving this approval and encouragement. I learned that, while it may

seem difficult for a teacher to remember the aspect of praise, linking it to specific activities can help to create more of a habit, ultimately benefiting both students and teacher. Praise in a classroom setting will help to encourage students to strive to act in their best behavior, as well as to encourage a great amount of effort on work that will be submitted.

With the three of these articles, I was able to form a much better idea based on the negative impact of using shame in a classroom setting, either intentional or unintentional, as well as the positive outcomes of the use of praise in a class, as it encourages students to work harder and act in positive ways. I plan to use the knowledge that I gained through this assessment in order to create a safe and comfortable learning environment in the future, in which students will be able to experiment with their own ideas, and ultimately discover their identity through creative outlets.

During my *Super Soul Sunday* appearance I talked about shame in schools and used a harsh classroom example about a teacher calling a student stupid to explain the difference between shame and humiliation.

I also explained that regardless of the type of school (private, public, or charter) shame happens in every classroom and that it's still one of the most popular classroom management tools.

An excerpt of that interview was recently featured on Upworthy. I didn't know about that posting until I started seeing tweets and retweets on Twitter. As I was scrolling through them I started seeing tweets that read, "Another attack on teachers" and "The war on teachers continues."

My first reaction was, "Someone must have said something crappy about teachers in the comment section of that video." Then I realized that I was the one being accused of saying something crappy about teachers.

Truthfully, I couldn't believe it. I've been a teacher for 17 years. My sisters are public school teachers and one of them is married to a high school vice-principal.

When I watched the clip I realized exactly how it could be perceived as teacher-bashing – I'm pretty sure I would have felt the same way.

I immediately called my sisters. They both said, "Anyone who knows your work knows how much you respect teachers." I realized that the "anyone who knows your work" is the problem That's why I'll work to never make this mistake again. Teachers have a hard enough time without me using them as an example. Especially when shame is a huge issue in education and teachers are some of the people taking the bravest stance against it.

I'm sorry.

I believe teachers need more support, more appreciation, and more money.

I know that I am who I am today because of several amazing teachers.

I know that I'm a better parent because Charlie and Ellen have teachers who share their wisdom with me.

As a researcher, I do believe that shame is present in every school and in every classroom. As long as people are hardwired for connection, the fear of disconnection (aka shame) will always be a reality. I don't believe *shame-free* exists but I do believe shame-resilience exists and that there are teachers creating worthiness-validating, daring classrooms every single today.

My passion about "every" is/was a response to the fact that many people argue that shame is a public school issue or a "poor" school issue or a Catholic school issue or anything that's not who they are. That's not true. There are resource poor schools and public schools and Catholic schools doing amazing shame-resilience work every single day. And, I'm lucky enough to witness that personally every day.

I could and should have offered way more clarity about this.

When people tell me their organizations or classrooms or churches are "shame-free" it worries me. It means it's happening and no one is noticing or dealing with it. **Shame-free classrooms ≠ teachers not intentionally using shame.**

Even in shame-aware classrooms, I believe that we can say something that feels very benign to us and can be very shaming to a student for reasons we may not understand. I've done it. While teaching about shame. What allowed me to address and heal it was an open dialogue about shame and the students' courage to speak up. *How can we even recognize shame when we're convinced that it doesn't happen in our school or our classroom or our home?* We're human. It happens.

Based on my work, I do believe that shame is still one of the most popular classroom management tools. And, I'm often brought into schools to talk about this because administrators and teachers recognize it's happening. It's how many if not most of us were raised.

The problem is by using "STUPID" as an example on the show, we're all quick to say, "Not me! Never!" We miss that we can use shame to manage a classroom (or a boardroom or a home) with ==invalidating glances, ignoring, favoritism, sarcasm== (which were learning that young kids don't alway process as humor), ==eye rolls, disengagement, and many other nuanced behaviors==.

For example, during my summer course I referenced a classic text in social work and said, "How many of you are familiar with _____?" After class a small group of students approached me and explained that they felt "major shame" when they looked around and everyone had read that text *but them*. They are in a cohort of students who work full-time and are on a different course schedule. They said they struggle with "==good enough==" and "real grad students" already and that made it worse. I apologized and we discussed it in the big group the following day. My argument is that ==by denying that shame exists we shut ourselves down to that feedback==. And the real learning happens in those moments. Sometimes I do it well. Sometimes I don't. But I always try to circle back when I screw up because I know the possibility is very real.

As you can see in this example, shame is not always an issue in classrooms because teachers are using it intentionally. It's an issue because learning is vulnerable and classrooms are tender places. Some of the most daring classrooms I've seen are ones where teachers don't use shame at

all but recognize the physiology of students who are in that spiral and they intervene. Maybe it was a peer or their parents' pending divorce or body-image issues.

Here's my best attempt to clarify:

85% of the men and women we interviewed remember something so shaming from their school experience that it changed how they think of themselves as learners. Were those experiences always about teachers?

NO. There were certainly stories about being shamed by teachers, but it was also about students, administrators, parents, school social workers, and/or a system that is in desperate need of reform.

Teachers have tremendous power in our lives. That can also be seen here:

Over 90% of participants remember a specific teacher, coach, or clergy person who helped them believe in their worth and the value of their contribution.

How do system issues bring shame into the classroom? Best example: standardized testing***. Every spring we get emails from teachers who are at schools where children who fail the basic standardized tests are called out in public. Sometimes it's simply by giving stuffed animals to the students who passed and leaving the others empty-handed. One teacher emailed because they were asked to color-code the students' ID lanyards based on their scores.

Here's another example. This is a story from *Daring Greatly*:

Several years ago my sister Ashley called me crying. When I asked her what was wrong, she told me that the *Houston Chronicle* had published the name of every schoolteacher in the Houston Independent School District along with the bonus they received based on their students' standardized test scores. I hadn't seen the paper that day and I was stunned. And I was also confused.

"Ashley, you teach kindergarten. Your kids don't take the tests yet. Is your name in there?"

Ashley explained that her name was in there and that the paper reported that she got the lowest bonus available. What they didn't report was that it was the highest bonus available to kindergarten teachers. Imagine doing that—reporting everyone's salaries or bonuses and moreover reporting them inaccurately—to any other group of professionals.

"I'm in a total shame meltdown," Ashley said, still crying. "All I've ever wanted to do was to be a teacher. I work my butt off. I've hit up everyone in our family for money so I can buy school supplies for the kids who can't afford them. I stay after and help the parents help their kids. I don't get it. There are hundreds of teachers like me, and do you read about that in the paper? No. And it's not just about me. Some of the very best teachers I know volunteer to teach some of the most challenging students without any thought about how it's going to affect their scores or bonuses. They do it because they love their work and they believe in the kids."

I'm not arguing that teachers are perfect. **I do think shame is an issue in education and I've seen how it finds its way into classrooms in many different ways.** As a teacher I have made mistakes. I've unintentionally used shame when I was anxious and afraid. I've also stood toe to toe with shame and shoved it out the classroom door.

I'm not advocating for perfect teachers or perfect classrooms. I'm just fighting for awareness in schools. We need to understand how shame operates and the toll it takes on learning, teaching, and growing, regardless of the source.

One of my favorite quotes about shame and teaching is from a teacher. She left it on my Facebook page then gave me permission to include it in *Daring Greatly*:

"For me, teaching is about love. It is not about transferring information, but rather creating an atmosphere of mystery and imagination and discovery. When I begin to lose myself because of some unresolved pain or fears or the overpowering feelings of shame, then I no longer teach . . . I deliver information and I think I become irrelevant then."

Teaching is about love. If you're a teacher and I made your work more difficult. I'm sorry. You taught me an important lesson.

On February 12, a *New York Times* story linked to a video of a teacher in a well-known New York City charter school losing her temper and humiliating a first grader. Reactions were swift and varied. *Don't coddle kids. Some kids are tough to teach. This is just one moment in a teacher's work. The school is good—look at its test scores.*

This video itself, and some reactions to it, reveal a faulty understanding of the kind of educational experiences students—especially the most vulnerable—need to succeed in school, career, and civic life and of the role the adults play in creating those experiences.

Social and emotional conditions help students learn

Student learning is significantly compromised when students don't feel emotionally and intellectually safe. Our research points to the importance of students experiencing social and emotional as well as academic support from teachers. Other scholars' studies, including evidence-based CLASS assessments of the quality of instruction, are consistent with this finding.

One positive real-world example: In Anchorage, Alaska, *How to Teach Math as a Social Activity* builds on social and emotional learning and student-developed learning norms among a community of learners (and we should note that the program in Anchorage is one of the eight districts in the Collaborating Districts Initiative, which AIR is evaluating). Our soon-to-be-published research on the first four years of research of this systematic effort found that in Anchorage, attendance was significantly higher in the first, third, and fourth years of implementation in elementary school and in the second and third years in middle school. Both middle and high school GPAs were significantly higher in all four years after the district-wide focus on social and emotional learning was adopted.

Learning is more than test scores

Learning is more than what test performance measures, particularly learning that prepares young people to succeed in college, career, and civic life.

Although test performance is often a proxy for learning, learning is also about developing such skills as problem solving, critical thinking, communication, and self-management. Social and emotional learning, research shows, is key to acquiring these skills as well as to mastering and applying academic subject matter.

A teacher publicly berating a student and tearing up her work does not tee-up future deeper learning. The sensibilities critical to deeper learning become easier to develop when students individually and collectively own their learning, respect diverse perspectives, and feel safe taking academic risks.

Teaching is complex and more than what students' test scores reveal

Developing students' social and emotional competence and their ability to master and apply academic knowledge depends on effective curricula and sound pedagogical practices. In turn, these practices depend both on teacher technical skills and their own social and emotional competence—the knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed to manage their emotions, be aware of their behavior's effects on others, and learn from student's behavior.

Teaching is stressful, to be sure. But socially and emotionally competent teachers can prevent that stress from harming their students—critically important since adults with authority and power who lose their temper and punish a student model the very bullying and lack of self-control that we want students to avoid. What was captured on the video may well have been a momentary lapse. But the consequences of such lapses can linger. And preventing them requires 100 percent reliability—the same standards surgeons and air traffic controllers strive to

meet in their high-stress occupations, even though unnerving surprises happen in the operating room and the skies aren't always calm and clear.

A hard truth here is that teaching is a demanding job that not everyone can do well. Many teachers and principals simply aren't well-prepared for the emotional challenges of working with students who may experience prejudice, struggle habitually with hunger, watch a loved one die, battle a behavioral disorder, or lack access to quality health and dental care.

And some teachers may not be prepared to work with diverse learners whose backgrounds differ from their own. While most American teachers are white, middle class, and female, only 49 percent of students are white and twenty percent live in poverty. Almost 10 percent are English language learners.

The onus shouldn't be solely on teachers here. Conditions for teaching are co-created by principals, districts (or charter agencies), states, and the federal government. Districts and charter agencies in particular have a choice. They can focus mainly on short-term test performance or—as Anchorage, Austin, Cleveland, and five other districts in CASEL's Collaborating Districts Initiative do—emphasize teaching and supporting social and emotional wellness as well as academic growth for all their students.

The memes we'd rather see

The video that's making waves is about being test-driven rather than learning- and learner-driven. It's also about a profession in dire need of more support—from recruitment to preparation as well as professional development, support, and retention. In contrast, videos of classrooms look different when students are getting the educational experiences they need to succeed academically and thrive emotionally and where educators are well equipped to educate, support, and encourage today's diverse youth.

If warmer, more supportive learning environments and rigorous teaching are to become the norm, then we'll need to strive to:

1. Strategically recruit people into the teaching profession: candidates with the knowledge, skills, and dispositions needed to work with students in a caring and supportive way.

2. Ensure that all teachers understand child and youth development, the impacts of trauma, and other childhood adversities.

3. Prepare teachers and principals to meet the needs of diverse learners. Infuse diversity, inclusion, self-awareness, and cultural competence throughout all teacher preparation programs.

4. Support teachers' capacity to care by building their social and emotional competencies to manage stress, connect with every student, and differentiate instruction and support. Help them assess their own feelings, interests, values, biases, and strengths.

5. Stay focused on the social and emotional conditions for learning and long term mastery, not just short-term test performance.

6. Assess conditions for learning and school and classroom climate through actionable confidential student and family surveys. Use this and other evidence to improve learning and support student development.

7. Assess conditions for teaching through confidential teacher and staff surveys and use this and other evidence to improve teaching and support for teacher development.

Whether just once, or habitually, a teacher losing her cool is a problem for her, her students, the principal of her school, and the profession. She (or he) is responsible, even in stressful settings, but so are those who should be supporting her from her first teacher-preparation course throughout her career. The videotaped teaching moments that we want to go viral are like the one of Anchorage. They show that diverse learners can be engaged and academically supported and

that students can collaborate with each other and their teachers to <mark>promote the academic and social and emotional learning</mark> of everyone in the class.

As the majority of states across America adopt the Common Core Standards for reading and mathematics, teachers at all grade levels are eager to find tools that will <mark>encourage students to work harder</mark> to reach those ambitious outcome goals. Additionally, schools adopting Response to Intervention are seeking evidence-based strategies to motivate struggling students that can also be easily delivered in general-education classrooms.

Teacher praise is one tool that can be a powerful motivator for students. Surprisingly, research suggests that praise is underused in both general- and special-education classrooms (Brophy, 1981; Hawkins & Heflin, 2011; Kern, 2007). This guide offers recommendations to instructors for using praise to maximize its positive impact.Effective teacher praise consists of two elements: (1) a description of noteworthy student academic performance or general behavior, and (2) a signal of teacher approval (Brophy, 1981; Burnett, 2001).

PRAISE: WHAT THE RESEARCH SAYS

The power of praise in changing student behavior is that it both indicates teacher approval and informs the student about how the praised academic performance or behavior conforms to teacher expectations (Burnett, 2001). As with any potential classroom reinforcer, praise has the ability to improve student academic or behavioral performance—but only if the *student* finds it reinforcing (Akin-Little et al., 2004). Here are several suggestions for shaping praise to increase its effectiveness:

- **Describe Noteworthy Student Behavior.** Praise statements that lack a specific account of student behavior in observable terms are compromised—as they fail to give students performance feedback to guide their learning. For example, a praise statement such as *'Good job!'* is inadequate because it lacks a behavioral description (Hawkins & Heflin, 2011). However, such a statement becomes acceptable when expanded to include a behavioral element: *"You located eight strong source documents for your essay. Good job!"*

- **Praise Effort and Accomplishment, Not Ability.** There is some evidence that praise statements about general ability can actually reduce student appetite for risk-taking (Burnett, 2001). Therefore, teachers should generally steer clear of praise that includes assumptions about global student ability (e.g., *"You are a really good math student!"*; *"I can tell from this essay that writing is no problem for you."*). Praise should instead focus on specific examples of student effort or accomplishment (e.g*., "It's obvious from your grade that you worked hard to prepare for this quiz. Great work!"*). When praise singles out exertion and work-products, it can help students to see a direct link between the effort that they invest in a task and improved academic or behavioral performance.

- **Match the Method of Praise Delivery to Student Preferences.** Teachers can deliver praise in a variety of ways and contexts. For example, an instructor may choose to praise a student in front of a class or work group or may instead deliver that praise in a private conversation or as written feedback on the student's assignment. When possible, the teacher should determine and abide by a student's preferences for receiving individual praise. It is worth noting that, while most students in elementary grades may easily accept public praise, evidence suggests that middle and high-school students actually prefer

private praise (Burnett, 2001). So, when in doubt with older students, deliver praise in private rather than in public.

PRAISE: USE IN THE CLASSROOM

Praise is a powerful motivating tool because it allows the teacher to selectively encourage different aspects of student production or output. For example, the teacher may use praise to boost the student's performance, praising effort, accuracy, or speed on an assignment. Or the teacher may instead single out the student's work product and use praise to underscore how closely the actual product matches an external standard or goal set by the student. The table below presents descriptions of several types of praise-statements tied to various student goals:

Praise: Goal	Example
Student Performance: Effort. Learning a new skill requires that the student work hard and put forth considerable effort--while often not seeing immediate improvement. For beginning learners, teacher praise can motivate and offer encouragement by focusing on effort ('seat-time') rather than on product (Daly et al., 2007).	*"Today in class, you wrote non-stop through the entire writing period. I appreciate your hard work."*
Student Performance: Accuracy. When learning new academic material or behaviors, students move through distinct stages (Haring et al., 1978). Of these stages, the first and most	*"This week you were able to correctly define 15 of 20 biology terms. That is up*

challenging for struggling learners is acquisition. In the acquisition stage, the student is learning the rudiments of the skill and strives to respond correctly. The teacher can provide encouragement to students in this first stage of learning by praising student growth in *accuracy* of responding.	*from 8 last week. Terrific progress!"*Â
Student Performance: Fluency. When the student has progressed beyond the acquisition stage, the new goal may be to promote fluency (Haring et al., 1978). Teacher praise can motivate the student to become more efficient on the academic task by emphasizing that learner's gains in fluency (a combination of accuracy and speed of responding).	*"You were able to compute 36 correct digits in two minutes on today's math time drill worksheet. That's 4 digits more than earlier this week--impressive!"*
Work Product: Student Goal-Setting. A motivating strategy for a reluctant learner is to have him or her set a goal before undertaking an academic task and then to report out at the conclusion of the task about whether the goal was reached. The teacher can then increase the motivating power of student goal-setting by offering praise when the student successfully sets	"At the start of class, you set the goal of completing an outline for your paper. And I can see that the outline that you produced today looks greatâ€"it is

and attains a goal. The praise statement states the original student goal and describes how the product has met the goal.	well-structured and organized."
Work Product: Using External Standard. Teacher praise often evaluates the student work product against some external standard. Praise tied to an external standard reminds the student that objective expectations exist for academic or behavioral performance (e.g., Common Core State Standards in reading and mathematics) and provides information about how closely the student's current performance conforms to those expectations. When comparing student work to an external standard, the teacher praise-statement identifies the external standard and describes how closely the student's work has come to meeting the standard.	"On this assignment, I can see that you successfully converted the original fractions to equivalent fractions before you subtracted. Congratulationsâ€"you just showed mastery of one of our state Grade 5 math standards!"

PRAISE: TROUBLE-SHOOTING

One reason that praise is often underused in middle and high school classrooms may be that teachers find it very difficult both to deliver effective group instruction and to provide (and keep

track of) praise to individual students. Here are several informal self-monitoring ideas to help
teachers to use praise with greater frequency and consistency:

- **Keep Daily Score.** The teacher sets a goal of the number of praise-statements that he or
  she would like to deliver during a class period. During class, the teacher keeps a tally of
  praise statements delivered and compares that total to the goal.

- **Select Students for Praise: Goal-Setting and Checkup.** Before each class, the teacher
  jots down the names of 4-5 students to single out for praise. (This activity can be done
  routinely as an extension of lesson-planning.) After the class, the teacher engages in
  self-monitoring by returning to this list and placing a checkmark next to the names of
  those students whom he or she actually praised at least once during the class period.

- **Make It Habit-Forming: Tie Praise to Classroom Routines.** Like any other behavior,
  praise can be delivered more consistently when it becomes a habit. Here is an idea that
  takes advantage of the power of habit-formation by weaving praise into classroom
  routine: (1) The teacher first defines various typical classroom activities during which
  praise is to be delivered (e.g., large-group instruction; student cooperative-learning
  activities; independent seatwork, etc.). (2) For each type of activity, the teacher decides
  on a minimum number of group and/or individual praise statements that the instructor
  would like to deliver each day or class period as a part of the instructional routine (e.g.,
  'Large-group instruction: 5 praise-statements or more to the class or individual students',
  'Independent seatwork: 4 praise-statements or more to individual students'). (3) The
  teacher initially monitors the number of praise-statements actually delivered during each
  activity and strives to bring those totals into alignment with the minimum levels
  previously established as goals. (4) As delivery of praise becomes associated with
  specific activities, the onset of a particular class activity such as large-group instruction

serves as a reminder (trigger or stimulus) to deliver praise. In effect, praise becomes a habit embedded in classroom routine.